

GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, August 1, 2017 4:00 p.m. German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Commissioners Present: Charissa W. Durst, Anthony Hartke, Karen McCoy, Mark Ours, James Panzer

Commissioners Absent: Ned Thiell **City Staff Present**: Connie Torbeck

German Village Society Staff Present: Nancy Kotting

- I. CALL TO ORDER 4:05 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, August 29 2017 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, September 5, 2017 588 South Third Street
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Wednesday, July 5, 2017 MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) APPROVED
- **VII.** STAFF APPROVALS The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) APPROVED

- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 17-8-19

720 Jaeger Street

Daniel Pap (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-8-19, 720 Jaeger Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Pave Garage Approach

- Remove existing, deteriorated asphalt approach and regrade, as needed.
- Install new, poured concrete approach with brick border.
- Site plan to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) APPROVED



HOLDOVERS

2. 17-7-22

512 City Park Avenue

Epic Group Ohio (Applicant)

Igor & Rachel Ferst (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-7-22, 512 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Replace Deck Boards with Composite Decking

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-historic, pressure treated, wood decking boards on the side elevation, inset porch deck.
- Install new, Azek, TimberTech, Island Oak, Harvest Collection, composite decking, per the submitted product sample and specifications.
- Faux grain side to be exposed side up.
- Existing framing, footings, and footprint of existing deck to remain, as is.

Note: Composite decking is being approved at this specific location, for the following reasons:1) It is an inset porch on a side elevation; 2) No historic fabric is being removed; 3) The material does not try to simulate wood.

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (5-0-0) APPROVED

3. 17-5-38

207 East Deshler Avenue

Ziad Shaheen (Applicant/Owner)

A new fence was approved June 20, 2016 (COA # 16-7-20). New fence was built with stringers facing neighboring property. A code order has been issued.

This application was continued to allow time for the Applicant to submit a drawing to modify the existing, wood privacy fence, specifically by installing new stringers, as necessary, and vertical boards to rest on top of the existing concrete curb on the 199 E. Deshler Ave. side of the existing, wood privacy fence. The top of the wood privacy fence is to be trimmed out in the same manner on both sides. Said drawing may be reviewed and approved by Historic Preservation Office staff. HPO staff conducted a second site visit on June 19, 2017.

A drawing has been approved by HPO staff. The work is to be completed, in consultation with the HPO staff, before August 31, 2017.

Install New Fence

• Modify existing, 6'H, wood privacy fence, to include new, stringers and vertical boards on the 199 E. Deshler Avenue side of the fence.

NO ACTION REQUIRED

4. 17-6-36

753 South Fifth Street

Precision Slate & Tile Roofing Co. (Applicant)

Joanne Kesten (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated: In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, remove Application #17-6-36, 753 South Fifth Street from the agenda and from further consideration. Submittal of a new application is required to be placed on a future agenda. MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

5. 17-7-27

242 Lansing Street

3D/Group, Inc. (Applicant)

Vernon & Jenny Morrison (Owners)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-7-27, 242 Lansing Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Connector

- Build a new, one-story, 8' x 10' connector between existing garage and existing house, per the submitted drawings.
- Create new 3' x 6'8" opening in existing rear wall of house.
- Roof to be standing seam metal; color to be "Gray."
- Exterior siding to be board-and-batten.
- Door on west elevation to be full-light wood door.
- West elevation to include 3' 6" high x 5' 6" wide clerestory window.
- East elevation to include two (2), one-over-one sash to match existing windows on west side of main house.
- New wood deck to be on east side of connector, between existing garage and existing house.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Note: Reasons for approval: The connector is a small scale, it is not visible from any public right-of-way, and the connector is attaching new construction to new construction.

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (3-2[Ours & Hartke]-0) APPROVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 17-8-20

214 East Sycamore Street & 223 Lear Street William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Bill Mains & Brian Smith (Owners)

Prior to review of Application #17-8-20, Chairperson Panzer noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room. Commissioner Ours assumed the role of Chairperson.

Following the presentation by the Applicant and owners, Acting Chairperson Ours called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

Name, Address, Affiliation:	Issues/ Comments:	
Amy Weis 632 S. Fifth Street Area resident	 Opposes the parking variance due to parking issues on Lear St. Most residents do not have off street parking in the area. Submitted some photos of parking issues in the area. Submitted an email from area resident, Jean Roush, who could not attend. 	
Karen Kegelmeyer 618 S. Fifth Street Area resident	Stated agreement with the comments of Ms. Weis.	
Michele Whitaker 640 S. Fifth Street	 Stated agreement with the comments of Ms. Weis. Has concerns with the building and location of the windows which may affect privacy of their back yard. Concerns about cars, exhaust, lighting, and trash. Noted her driveway is sometimes blocked by cars. 	
David Whitaker 640 S. Fifth Street	 Stated agreement with the comments of Ms. Weis and Ms. Whitaker. Concerns with setback from the street. 	

4

Pat Bates 625 S. Fifth Street Area resident	 Appreciates the house is being remodeled. Has concerns with run-off water and flooding of basements. The previously open land that handled run-off will now be covered with a building. Agrees that parking is an issue in the area. 	
Cathy Hunsinger Area resident	Submitted written comments for the record. Opposes the parking reduction. Several houses do not have off street parking. It's a safety concern to have to park and walk too far from home. Parking too close to corners is a safety concern.	

Following the public speaker(s), further presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion(s) were made, vote(s) taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated. Upon review of Application #17-8-20, 214 East Sycamore Street & 223 Lear Street, the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance(s), as modified by the Applicant & Owners:

Request for Variance Recommendation/Lot Split

TRACT 1 = 214 E. Sycamore St

TRACT 2 = 223 Lear St

- 1. 3332.14 R-2F Area District Requirements
 - (214) Lot area from 6,000 sf to 5,576 sf
 - (223) Lot area from 6,000 sf to 4,216 sf
- 2. 3332.19 Fronting on a Public Street
 - (223) To permit a residence to front on a public alley
- 3. 3332.21 (F) Building Lines
 - (223) Front yard setback from 10' to 3'
- 4. 3342.15 Maneuvering
 - (214) From maneuvering on site to maneuvering off site

(filed easements shall be required)

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (4-0-1[Panzer]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

Note: Following discussion, and public speakers, the Applicant & Owners withdrew the originally requested variance #5, for reduction of required parking spaces from two (2) spaces to one (1) space.

7. 17-8-21

843 Mohawk Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Craig Colvin & Lisa Stein (Owners)

Prior to review of Application #17-8-21, Chairperson Panzer returned to the table and resumed the role of Chairperson.

Following presentation by the Applicant & owners, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-8-21, 843 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Convert Two Dwellings to Single-Family Dwelling/Connector

- Build a new, one-story connector between the two dwellings at 843-847 and 849 Mohawk Street.
- Exterior cladding to be Boral 1 x 6 shiplap siding.
- Roof to have shallow slope with EPDM.
- Doors on east and west elevations to be full-light.

South Elevation (849)

- Remove existing, rectangular window opening on south elevation of the rear, frame addition to the existing brick cottage
- Install new wood siding on south elevation of the rear, frame addition to the existing brick cottage.

New Addition (843-847)

• Construct a new, one-and-one-half story addition to the rear of the existing, one-story, frame addition.

- Exterior cladding to be brick.
- Shed dormers to be on east and west slopes of roof.
- Windows to be Marvin, all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash with cut stone sills and lintels.
- First floor windows on north and south elevation to have louvered shutters.
- Final design for louvered shutters on north and south elevations to return to German Village Commission for review and approval.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles from approved roofing shingles list.
- Final construction drawings and cut sheets for windows, doors, and exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (5-0-0) APPROVED

8. 17-8-22

1120 Jaeger Street

C.J. Andrews/Mode Architects (Applicant)

Thurman Partners, LLC. (Owners)

Prior to review of Application #17-8-22, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room. Following presentation of the staff report, presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-8-22, 1120 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: <u>Install New Windows</u>

- Remove the existing, non-original, deteriorated, wood, six-over-one and one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the rear portion of the building (six on west elevation, six on east elevation, and three on north elevation), per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, Marvin, Wood Ultimate insert, one-over-one, double-hung windows, per the submitted product cut sheet.

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (4-0-1 [Ours]) APPROVED

9. 17-8-23

210-220 Thurman Avenue

C.J. Andrews/Mode Architects (Applicant)

Thurman Partners, LLC. (Owners)

Commissioner Ours continued to recuse himself from the proceedings for Application # 17-8-23, 210-220 Thurman Avenue. Following presentation of the staff report and presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Panzer called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

Name, Address, Affiliation:	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Theresa Hutching 1113 Blackberry Alley Neighboring Property Owner	 Expressed concerns about safety and health issues and the proximity of the dumpster enclosure to her property. Provided photos and discussed how other businesses deal with dumpsters and trash.

Following the public speaker(s), further presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion(s) were made, vote(s) taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated. Approve Application 17-8-22, 1120 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Modify Previous Approval/Dumpster Enclosure

- Remove existing dumpster enclosure, per the submitted photographs.
- Relocate dumpster enclosure, per the submitted site plan.

Install New Privacy Fence

• Install a new, single-sided, 6' high privacy fence and gate, per the submitted site plan and detail drawing. MOTION: Durst/Hartke (0-3-2 [Ours & Panzer]) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

3116.13 - Standards for site improvements.

(A) Landscaping, parking, utility or service areas, walkways and similar improvements should be compatible to each other and to the subject building or structure as well as to adjacent contributing properties, open spaces and the overall environment.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

10. 17-7-29

475 South Third Street

Metropolitan GV, LLC. (Applicant/Owners)

<u>Install Permanent Signage Frame/Option 1</u>

- Install one (1), new, wall mounted, beveled tension frame, secured to brick wall with mechanical fasteners.
- HDU panel to be 10' High x 2" Deep x 12' Wide, with carved, V-Groove, gold leaf letters, reading "GERMAN VILLAGE."
- Banners to be displayed in frames with viewable opening of 67.36 sq. ft.
- Frame to be painted dark green to match building trim color.
- HDU panel to be black.
- V-Groove letters to be 22 kt gold leaf.

Install Permanent Signage Frame/Option 2

- Install two (2), new, wall mounted, beveled tension frames, secured to brick wall with mechanical fasteners.
- HDU panel to be 15' High x 2" Deep x 19' Wide, with carved, V-Groove, gold leaf letters, reading "GERMAN VILLAGE."
- Banners to be displayed in frames with viewable opening of 50.21 sq. ft. each.
- Frame to be painted dark green to match building trim color.
- HDU panel to be black.
- V-Groove letters to be 22 kt gold leaf.

Following presentation by the Applicant and Signcom representative, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Panzer:

- The proposed sign falls outside the German Village Guidelines for signage, which is generally 6 sf and is limited to the name of the business and phone number, etc.
- Concerned that this would be creating, in effect, a billboard over which the Commission would have no control. The sign could potentially be used for political or for-profit advertising with no control over content.
- The Commission has considered larger signs for more vehicular-oriented streets, such as Livingston Avenue.
- Thinks it may be possible to develop parameters for this type of signage that could be initially approved by the Commission, with follow-up approvals by HPO staff.

Commissioner McCoy:

- The German Village Guidelines refer to signage as being pedestrian-oriented, while the proposed sign appears to be vehicular-oriented, as a billboard.
- Appreciates the community aspects of the existing banners. They are welcoming to people who come into the area. Personally likes the varying graphics.

- 7
- Concerned about the "frame" that would prescribe the size of what could be there. Also concerned about days the frame would be empty.
- Would almost rather see a better way of anchoring temporary signs.
- Noted that her business firm is assisting the Society with small historical markers, but not studying the type of sign in this proposal.

Commissioner Hartke:

• It would be helpful to know where the German Village Society's initiative stands regarding more consistent signage/graphics within the village.

Commissioner Ours:

- Would be helpful to understand how large graphics are handled by the Downtown Commission and/or other architectural review commissions.
- Could not support the proposed signage "frame" unless it includes 365 days of content approved by the Commission. It could be just "Welcome" that would be up there a large part of the year. Would want any art work to be approved either by the Commission or by Historic Preservation Office staff.
- It would be redundant for both the frame and the sign to include "German Village."

NO ACTION TAKEN

11, 17-8-24

399 East Livingston Avenue

Northstar Realty (Applicant)

Education First Credit Union, Inc. (Owners)

Repurpose Portion of Building for Coffee Shop

- Eastern portion of existing building to be occupied by coffee shop. Remainder of building to be office space.
- Install new, drive-thru window on east elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- Replace one (1) existing window on north elevation with new glass entry door.
- Install new entrance doors on rear/south elevation.

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install new brick piers, landscape wall, and fencing to match existing, for outdoor seating area.
- Install new landscaping, per the submitted site plan.

Signage

- Install new drive-thru menu on rear/south elevation.
- Install new directional and business signage.

Prior to review of Application #17-8-24, Commissioner Hartke noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.

Following presentation by the project architect and attorney, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Noted that the building immediately north of the proposed 234 sf addition is a contributing property.
- Appreciates the changes made based on Commissioner comments at the business meeting, i.e., lowering the brick pier height of the fence, and squaring off the fence at the site triangle.

Commissioner Ours:

- The proposed work on the non-contributing building seems fine, i.e., the changing of the doors, the patio along Livingston Avenue.
- Because of the relationship of the proposed addition to the contributing structure immediately to the north, the addition should be pulled back into the recess a bit (not flush).
- Strongly encourages the use of a different material on the addition than the existing brick building. It probably could be brick, but would be better to be a contrasting material.
- Has some concern about the parapet height on the addition. The historic windows should not be obscured.

- Has some concerns about the stoop at the "Doctors' Office." It would be more historically appropriate if the stoop came straight forward. Please provide a clear current photo of the area where the stoop would go.
- The most appropriate solution would be to remove all of the existing, brick piers and metal fencing and the existing inappropriate stoops, and install simple, modern fencing and simple, forward facing stoops open to the sidewalk, and more pedestrian friendly.
- The fence in front of the new coffee shop patio does not need to continue the existing brick pier fencing. It could match the modern design of the coffee shop.
- May be better to go with a simple, one-over-one sash on the addition, rather than six-over-six. One-over-ones could be used on the entire, non-contributing building.

Commissioner McCoy:

- Agrees with Commissioner Ours regarding the fencing and stoops.
- Consider the maintenance issues related to any strip of landscape area between the fence along Livingston Avenue and the sidewalk. If left as green space, it will need to be planted and maintained.

Commissioner Durst:

- In general agreement with Commissioner Ours' comments.
- Please provide photos and details of any repairs required for the contributing building, in association to the proposed addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN

12. 17-8-25

827 City Park Avenue

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Evan & Kim Sauer (Owners)

Prior to review of Application #17-8-25, Commissioner Hartke returned to the table.

Demolition

• Demolish the existing, one-story, concrete block rear addition.

New Addition

• Build new, one-and-one-half story rear addition with one-story connector, per the submitted drawings.

Following presentation by the project architect and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Based on HPO staff's site visit report and the testimony of the architect, the Commission concurred that the existing, concrete block, rear addition is not original and/or is highly modified. It lacks architectural significance and integrity.

Commissioner Ours:

- Need to see a site plan, including percentage of lot coverage. The Commission has considered lot coverage in the low 50s when it is a very small lot or some other hardship exists. 58% lot coverage is higher than the Commission has recommended in the past. Understands that a non-conforming variance will be required.
- Appreciates that the primary house is diminutive, but the addition needs to be subservient to the primary house. None of the currently proposed designs options achieve that.
- Consider breaking the addition into pieces. Break the mass into pieces to make it subservient to the main house.
- Option B seems too Craftsman in style.
- There is precedent for an addition to be 12-18" taller than the primary house.

Commissioner Panzer:

- There is precedent for additions stepping down from the main house.
- The location of the open space is less of an issue than that open space exists.
- Would not be concerned with the addition going back farther, if the lot coverage can be reduced.

Commissioner McCoy:

• There seems to be a lot of similar examples of additions to cottages in the village.

9

• A color rendering may be helpful in understanding the scale of the addition in relation to the original house.

Commissioner Durst:

- The addition options have the appearance of separate, free standing houses rather than an addition.
- Agrees with Commissioner Ours' comment about dividing the addition into more pieces.

Commissioner Hartke:

- If the addition gets too tall, it could look like a tower behind a row of $1\frac{1}{2}$ story cottages.
- Typically, if the one-story demo (rear addition) was not there already, engaging the corner of the house would not be allowed. So, there is already precedent of a structure engaging the corner.
- You could mitigate the rise by adding a small, perpendicular sliver with a less high pitch directly behind the cottage, then, behind that, potentially go up a little higher.
- Need to consider the rear view onto adjacent properties.

NO ACTION TAKEN

13. 17-8-26

595 South Sixth Street

J. David Plunkett (Applicant)

Jim Plunkett (Owner)

This application was withdrawn by the Applicant on July 28, 2017.

New Addition

- Build a new, 320 sq. ft. addition to connect the existing brick house and existing, one-and-one-half story garage, per the submitted drawings.
- New one-and-one-half story addition to have fiber cement, board-and-batten siding and standing-seam-metal roof.
- One story connector section to include full-lite door and large windows on south elevation.

APPLICATION WITHDRAWN

NO ACTION REQUIRED

14. 17-8-27

862 South Third Street

Sabrena Noria (Applicant/Owner)

New Addition to House

- Demolish existing, one-story, rear addition.
- Build new, 10' extension to existing, rear addition, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Proposed new rear/east elevation to include stone veneer, French doors, and second floor Juliette balconies, per the submitted renderings.

Demolish Concrete Block Garage

- Demolish the existing concrete block garage.
- Build new carriage house.
- Proposed new rear elevation to include French doors, balcony, and stairway.
- Exterior materials to include horizontal siding and stone.

Following presentation by the applicant and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Panzer:

- If the block garage is determined to be a contributing property, approval of its demolition would be unlikely.
- French balconies (on the house) looking onto the rear yard is not the biggest issue. It is the massing.
- If the existing, two-story addition to the house came before the Commission today, it would likely not be allowed to be as tall as it is, and the proposed addition is higher still.
- The height of the eave line on the existing, two-story, rear addition is important to consider.

Commissioner Ours:

- The garage's location on Lazelle Street is very visible on a residential street.
- Need to look at Sanborn maps and have staff do a site visit to determine the age and condition of the garage before determining for certain if it is a contributing building.
- The house addition needs to be subservient to the primary structure. That probably means the upper band needs to come away.
- Not opposed to the proposed balconies or fenestration of the house addition, but need to find a way to make the
 detailing more secondary.
- The submitted precedent photo seems more toned down than the rendering. Consider removing some of the detailing and make it more simple, like shown on the precedent photo.
- Not opposed to the aesthetic or materials, but the addition to the house should not be more ornamental than the primary structure.
- Does not think that three bays over three bays with French balconies on the rear elevation of the house addition would be out of character if simply designed.
- Look at bringing the roof of the proposed addition down 12-18" and tucking it under the existing eave.
- Because the addition is so far back on the lot, not sure that a connector is even needed.
- Thinks an addition to the garage could go out to the back as long as it is subservient to the existing garage. A second floor on an addition would be a challenge.

Commissioner McCoy:

• In agreement with Commissioner Ours' comments on the house addition.

Commissioner Durst:

• In agreement with Commissioner Ours' comments on the house addition.

Commissioner Hartke:

- No additional comments regarding the house addition.
- Going wider than a 16' door opening on the garage would likely require two single door openings rather than one large opening.
- The Commission usually supports only a bedroom and bath or kitchen and bath on the second floor of a garage, not a bedroom, bath, and kitchen.

NO ACTION TAKEN

15. 17-8-28

257 Lansing Street

Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)

Britta Larsen (Owner)

Demolition

• Demolish the existing, one-story, rear addition.

New Addition

- Construct a new, 1.5 story addition at the rear of the existing dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be wood siding.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles
- Windows to be one-over-one, double-hung sash.

Following presentation by the applicant and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Ours:

- In regard to massing, look at pulling the east edge of the new addition in a bit where it meets the main block of the house.
- Noted that the new addition is not tying into the existing slate anywhere.

Commissioner Panzer:

• Asked for clarification on any overhang issues.

Commissioner Hartke:

No additional comments.

Commissioner Durst:

No additional comments.

Commissioner Hartke:

No additional comments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 17-8-29

113 Thurman Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)

Crescent G. Medley (Owner)

New Carriage House

- First conceptual review for construction of a new, one-and-one-half story carriage house at the rear of the lot.
- Second story space to include a bedroom/office space and bath.
- Access easement via existing parking lot is in place.
- BZA variance will be required.

Following presentation by the applicant and property owners, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- Noted that a large garage was recently approved southwest of this property.
- Asked if the width of the access easement (through the parking lot) would be sufficient to enter the two garage doors.
- No issues were raised by Commissioners about the concept of a garage at this location.
- Will need to see the variance package.

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 17-8-30

1000 Jaeger Street

Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)

Larry Lehring (Owner)

Demolition

- Remove the existing, one-story, frame, rear addition on the two-story frame house.
- Remove second story exterior wall.

New Addition/House

- Build new, one-and-one-half story, frame addition and porch on rear elevation.
- Build new, one-story connector.
- Exterior cladding to be wood siding, to match original siding.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles.
- New windows to be casements.
- New doors to be full-light.

Following presentation by the applicant and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- Noted that Sanborn maps show the garage was built after 1951. It does not appear that demolition of the garage would be an issue.
- The addition to the house stepping into the side yard does not seem to be an issue. Several similar examples exist along the street.
- The proposed addition to the house seems appropriate. It has the right kind of connector.

NO ACTION TAKEN

18. 17-8-31

172 Thurman Ave (aka 170 Thurman Ave)

Mark & Keriann Ours (Applicants/Owners)

Prior to review of Application #17-8-31, Commissioner Ours moved to the opposite side of the table to represent himself as the Applicant.

New Addition

• First conceptual review for a new, rear addition, per the submitted drawings.

Following presentation by the applicant, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Sees nothing in the proposal that causes major concerns.
- Thinks it will be interesting to see the contrast of the main house from 1900, the commercial building from the 1950s, and the modern addition from the 2000s.

Commissioner Durst:

• The proposed addition seems to meet the usual criteria. The historic corner is still exposed. The gasket is lower and tucks under the eaves of the existing building. And, the addition has the appearance of an addition.

Commissioner McCoy:

• Given the character of the office structure, does not see any visibility of the addition from the street as an issue. Any piece that may be visible when trees are bare would seem to be in character with the barber shop building.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Does have some concern about the height of the east wall on the proposed addition. Will it loom over the adjacent property?
- Thinks the detail for material provided on the west elevation mitigates the lack of windows on the second floor.
- The proposed style of the addition is contemporary with current styles of today as opposed to being something that attempts to reproduce a specific, historical style of the past. The Commission has generally looked favorably on contemporary additions as long as they don't negatively impact the historic fabric of the existing building.

NO ACTION TAKEN

19. 17-8-32

172 Thurman Ave (aka 170 Thurman Ave)

Mark & Keriann Ours (Applicants/Owners)

Commissioner Ours continued to represent himself as the Applicant for review of Application #17-8-32. Upon review of Application #17-8-32, 172 Thurman Ave (aka 170 Thurman Ave), the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance(s), as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.25 – Maximum side vards required

The sum of the widths of each side yard shall equal or exceed 20 percent of the width of the lot, provided that not more than the following need be so devoted:

(A) In R-rural, LRR, RRR or RR districts – 32 feet;

(B) In SR, R-1, R-2, R-3, R-2F, R-4 or MHD districts – 16 feet.

2. 3332.26 – Minimum side yard permitted.

The minimum side yard shall be the least dimension between any part of the building or structure and the side lot line, which least dimension shall be as follows:

- (C) In R-2F and R-4 districts:
- (2) For a single-family dwelling on a lot more than 40 feet wide, no less than five feet;

3. 3391.05 – Limits to modifications of nonconforming structures.

A. A nonconforming structure, other than a graphic or billboard, may not be moved, repaired, maintained, altered or enlarged except as allowed by this chapter or required by law.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (4-0-1[Ours]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

20, 17-7-28

170-174 Thurman Avenue

Mark Ours (Applicant)

Mark & Keriann Ours (Owners)

Commissioner Ours continued to represent himself as the Applicant for review of Application #17-7-28. Approve Application 17-7-28, 1120 Jaeger Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Landscaping/170 Thurman Avenue

- Retain and reset two (2) existing, limestone steps at front porch
- Remove three (3) existing concrete steps and concrete landing leading to front porch.
- Remove existing concrete sidewalk on east side of house.
- New, 6' wide steps and cheek wall returns to align with the front wall of the existing office building at 174 Thurman Avenue.
- Regrade sloping front yard to create level surface.
- Install new, smooth, architectural concrete walls with buff wash finish along front of property.

Landscaping/174 Thurman Avenue

- Remove concrete pad in front of existing storefront.
- Remove stone retaining walls on east and west sides of concrete pad.
- Install new, brick pavers, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new, smooth, architectural concrete walls with buff wash finish on east and west sides of new brick pavers.
- Install new ornamental tree and planting bed, per the submitted site plan.

New Public Sidewalk & Planting Bed

- Remove existing, concrete, public sidewalk in front of 170 and 174 Thurman Avenue.
- Install new, concrete sidewalk with planting bed, per the submitted site plan.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as needed, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (4-0-1[Ours]) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

• 17-8-1

192 Thurman Avenue

D. Rees Alexander (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-1, 192 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Existing concrete/stone chimney coping to be retained or replaced, in-like-kind.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).

17-8-2

483 Lazelle Street

Michael J. Ferris/Mike Ferris Properties (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-2, 483 Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- Paint to match existing colors.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the main house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

17-8-3

272 East Sycamore Street

Superior Home Maintenance (Applicant)

William Mitchell (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-3, 272 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.

15

• Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color selected by the owner from the approved shingles list:

[] Tamko (standard 3-tab) [] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

17-8-4

793 South Third Street

Larry & Heidi Drake (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-4, 793 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install Tie Rods

- Install new, structural tension rods (masonry anchor plates) to stabilize the front wall of the one-and-one-half story, brick cottage, due to lateral brick displacement.
- Exterior anchor plates to be star-shaped, per the submitted photographs.
- New ties to be installed at the floor framing level, per the submitted photographs.

• 17-8-5

637 City Park Avenue

Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)

Alice Lamotte (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-5, 637 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Install new rubber roof, per the submitted specifications.
- Remove any/all asphalt or rolled roofing on the rear, flat roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Install New Skylights

- Remove the two (2), existing skylights on the rear, flat roof, per the submitted photographs.
- Install two (2) new, Velux SCM 2246, curb mounted skylights, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- All work to be completed in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.

Install New Asphalt Shingles/Bay Window

- Remove all existing asphalt shingles, and install new, asphalt singles on the existing bay window on the south elevation.
- New shingles to be chosen from the approved roofing shingles list.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

• Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the rear, flat-roofed section of the house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.

- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

17-8-6

768 Jaeger Street

Justin Collamore/Collamore Built (Applicant)

Jeff & Lucy Caswell (Owners)

Approve Application #17-8-6, 768 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted. Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Per the submitted paint color chips, paint color scheme to be as follows: Body SW0055 "Light French Gray;" Trim PPG1096-2 "Morocco Sand;" Window Sashed/Porch Floor PPG1005-7 'Dark Granite."
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.
- Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Paint Metal Roof

- Powerwash existing, metal roof on rear addition, as needed.
- Prime all metal surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer, as needed, according to manufacturer's specifications. Finnish color to "Slate Gray."

17-8-7

738 South Sixth Street

Camille Merkle (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-7, 738 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof/Front Porch Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the front porch roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the approved shingles list:

[] GAF Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) [] Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Re-flash any existing chimneys on the main roof, as needed.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."

Install New Downspouts

• Install new, round, metal down spouts and elbows of the appropriate dimension, as needed.

17-8-8

724 Macon Alley

Lauren Bandman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-8, 724 Macon Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as
 necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and
 profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys and the two (2) existing skylights.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color selected by the owner from the approved shingles list:
- [] Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) [] Estate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

17-8-9

Beck Place Condos (624-648 Jaeger St.; 307-321 E. Beck St.; 621-651 S. Grant Ave.) Cindy Hagen for Beck Place Condo Assoc. (Applicant) Multiple Owners

Approve Application #17-8-9, Beck Place Condominiums, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Exterior Light Fixtures

- Remove the existing, wall-mounted, exterior light fixtures on all elevations, including main entrances, patios, and garages.
- Install new, wall-mounted, exterior light fixtures in the same locations, per the submitted product cut sheet. Finish color to be "Black."
- All fasteners to be placed into mortar, not into the face of the brick.

• 17-8-10

576 South Third Street

Metroscape, LLC. (Applicant)

David Magee & Cheryl Roberto (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-10, 576 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, wood, privacy fence located on the north side of the house, per the submitted photographs and site plan.
- Install a new, wood, privacy fence in the same location, to match existing fence height and design, like-for-like.
- New fence to be painted to match existing color, SW7048, "Urbane Bronze."

Note: This fence design was originally approved by the German Village Commission August 3, 2004 (COA # 04-8-20).

• 17-8-11

733 Jaeger Street

Sharon & Richard Pettit (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-11, 733 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Awning

- Install one (1) new, Sunbrella, acrylic fabric awning (#4608) above the main entrance on the side (south) elevation, per the submitted photo rendering and drawing. Fabric color to be "black."
- New awning to measure 3' 6" wide, per the submitted drawing.
- Sides of awning to be open, with free-hanging front flap.
- Metal frame to be painted "black," to match awning fabric.

• 17-8-12

700 Mohawk Street

Art & Natalia Roca (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-12, 700 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Masonry Cleaning

• Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. If air pressure is needed, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings," http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm).

• 17-8-13

751 Jaeger Street

Able Roof (Applicant)

Jeanne Likins (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-13, 751 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof/House & Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and garage, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as
 necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and
 profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer: [] CertainTeed	Style: Carriage House (dimensional)	Color: [] Stonegate Gray
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate [] Weathered Slate
[] Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[] Estate Gray

19

[] Tamko (standard 3-tab) [] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- Install new, rubber membrane roof on flat/low sloped areas, as needed.

• 17-8-14

922 South Lazelle Street

Maurice M. Manring & Michele A. McFadden (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-14, 922 South Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: <u>Siding Repair/Exterior Painting</u>

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements, as needed. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood siding and trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.

• 17-8-15

195 East Columbus Street

Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)

Elizabeth Fisher (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-15, 195 East Columbus Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Exterior Painting/Front Porch Floor

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood floor boards, as needed. <u>All replacement</u> wood to be of same dimension and profile as the existing wood floor boards like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all wooden surfaces on the porch floor for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint finish coat color to match existing.

17-8-16

73-75 East Blenkner Street (aka 515 S. Third St.)

Columbia Gas of Ohio (Applicant)

Robert J. O'Donnell (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-16, 73-75 East Blenkner Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Lattice Gate/Front Porch

- Remove an approximately 3' wide section of the existing, latticework, front porch apron.
- Install new, hinged section of latticework, front porch apron in the same location, to provide access to gas meters located beneath the porch.
- Paint to match existing color, "White."

• 17-8-17

515 South Third Street

Columbia Gas of Ohio (Applicant)

Brian O'Donnell (Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-17, 515 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Gas Meter

- Remove the concrete slab at the base of the unused, fixed-shut doorway on the east elevation of the enclosed, rear porch, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new gas meter at foundation level, on the north elevation of the house, east of the existing basement window opening.

Enclose Basement Window

- Install plywood over basement window on the north elevation of the house, adjacent to the enclosed rear porch. Plywood to be exterior grade, 3/4", smooth on one side, and primed on all sides prior to installation.
- Plywood to be cut to fit the existing window jamb; outside-to-outside.
- Jamb and sash to remain in place.
- Size of existing masonry opening to remain the same.
- Following installation, plywood to be painted "Black" or a color that matches the existing foundation color as closely as possible, to make the plywood as least visible as possible.
- Install new vent in plywood window cover.
- New landscaping to be installed to screen the new meter and basement window.

17-8-18

33 East Deshler Avenue

Kevin Hock (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-8-18, 33 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Brick Sidewalk

- Remove the existing, concrete sidewalk located between the two existing, concrete driveways, and the portion of concrete extending to the street, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new paying bricks in the 90-degree Herringbone pattern. New sidewalk dimensions to match existing.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Hartke/ () 8:24 p.m.